

CDIS 5025 3.0/ HLST 4020 3.0 History of Health Care Ethics from Ancient Times to the Present

FALL 2015

Wednesdays, 11:30-2:30

September 16, 2015 – December 2, 2015

Course Instructor: Geoffrey Reaume

Description:

Contemporary debates in health care ethics have a history that crosses all cultures and historical periods, from ancient times to the present. Debates over abortion, assisted suicide, end of life care, euthanasia, health care for the poor and marginalized, treatment of persons with disabilities, experimentation, and financial compensation for practitioners, among other topics, have been informed by divergent views on health care ethics for over two thousand years. The purpose of this course is to explore how diverse, often competing views about health care ethics have developed in the context of the time and culture which gave rise to these ideas and practices. This is more than a history of ideas about health care ethics, as this course is also a history of how ethical principles, or the lack thereof, in health care treatments, impacted upon people both as recipients and as practitioners. Students will obtain a broad historical understanding of why the history of health care ethics is important to an understanding of contemporary debates by critically examining the historical context of these ideas and practices with a focus on specific themes to highlight particular periods and issues.

This course will include a mixture of lectures and seminar in-class discussions with an emphasis on the latter.

Course Objectives:

1. To emphasize the historical connections between health care ethics in the past and its relevance to debates in the present.
2. To make critical comparisons between continuities and disruptions in the history of health care ethics.
3. To analyze how these continuities and disruptions have had a direct bearing on the various types of treatments that have been available, or have not been available, to diverse groups of people at different periods in the past and why this is relevant today.
4. To understand the inter-connections between marginalized people in history and the implications this has had and continues to have on the theory and practice of health care ethics.
5. To think about how we have addressed, or might in the future deal with, some of these historical issues in our own work and personal lives.

Accommodation:

Students with disabilities who need accommodation are encouraged to contact the course instructor as soon as possible.

Evaluation and Assignments:

All assignments must be typed and have one consistent citation style (APA or MLA or Chicago). Composition, spelling and grammar is a very important part of all written work and will make up fifty per cent of the mark within each written assignment.

Be sure to paginate your typed assignments.

ACADEMIC INTEGRITY

Any acts of academic dishonesty including plagiarism, submitting the same paper twice, or failure to cite sources are taken seriously and handled according to York University Policy. For details, please refer to the [Faculty of Graduate Studies calendar](#) and the [Senate Policy on Academic Policy](#) posted online.

Plagiarism

Plagiarism is defined as the submission of work which you did not write, will get a minimum of zero for that assignment and may lead to formal charges of academic dishonesty. This could result in an F in the course, depending on the extent of plagiarism, and it may also lead to expulsion from the university. ***It is the sole responsibility of each student to ensure that your work is honest and is not plagiarized.*** All students are required to read the full York policy on [academic integrity](#) and also to complete the [tutorial](#) about how to respect these procedures:

ASSIGNMENTS:

(Please see additional details about requirements for each assignment on pages 3 and 4). Unless informed otherwise, all written assignments provided on the due date (#1, 2, 3) will be marked within two weeks; assignments provided at later times due to accommodation will be returned whenever graded.

1) 15% - Book Review:

The format is **5-7 double-spaced pages (1250 – 1750 words)** on a book about the history of health care ethics. It can be chosen from the course reading list or it can be chosen from outside the reading list. The book should be approved by the course instructor by October 7. **Due on Wednesday October 14.**

A book review is not intended to be merely a summary of the content of the book under consideration but it should be a critical evaluation of the author's writing, research and analysis. A book review should explain the positive and negative aspects

of the book, the author's contribution to the area of research he/she focuses on and the relevance of this particular source to your understanding of the history of health care ethics.

2) 25% - Annotated Bibliography:

The format is **8-10 double-spaced pages**. This bibliography can be focused on a topic related to your final research essay. Please inform the course instructor of your assignment topic by October 28. **Due on Wednesday November 4.**

This work can serve as preliminary research for your final research essay. An annotation for one source should be a concise summary of the main points of that particular source related to a specific theme in the history of health care ethics. Each annotation should be half of one page in length, double-spaced, for a total of 20 annotations – two annotations per page – for the entire assignment

3) 35% - Final Research Paper:

The format is **15 to 20 double-spaced pages (3750 – 5000 words)**, not including endnotes or bibliography. Please inform the course instructor of your assignment topic by November 4, if the focus of this assignment is different from your annotated bibliography. **Due on December 2.**

A research topic in the history of health care ethics will be chosen in consultation with the instructor. Suggested topics will be provided on the first day of class. Your essay should be a critical examination of a topic which considers:

- the historical context of health care ethics during the period under consideration;
- the importance of your topic to ethics debates, then and now;
- a critical analysis of how a particular ethics debate was interpreted by people who lived in a given historical era and how the issues under consideration are viewed today

4) 10% - In-class presentation:

Please choose a selected reading from the reading list. Students will be emailed within one week of your presentation with feedback and mark for this assignment.

By the end of the second class, all students will be asked to choose one course reading for future presentation to be done in class by the end of term. Student presentations will include a brief discussion of the main points of the article lasting 10 to 15 minutes in length followed by two questions to the class. Depending on the overall number of students in this course, two students may present two articles together though each student will be marked individually.

5) 15% - Attendance and Overall Participation

Attendance will be taken during every class. If you are not able to attend a class please inform me. Regular participation is extremely important in a fourth year and graduate course. In-class participation is essential for an instructor to assess a student's familiarity with the readings and efforts to understand the subject matter. Students

who are shy about in-class participation are welcome to meet with me to discuss ways for you to participate.

Assignment Notes:

Where appropriate, you should refer to significant differences of views among historians about ethical issues if it influences your analysis of a particular topic. For example, some historians say the development of professional health care ethics codes in mid-19th century United States was more of a public relations ploy by doctors to win over public support for increasing regulatory influence in the health care field while other historians say it was a genuine effort to improve health care delivery. A student may therefore need to consider the contentious nature of how the historical development of health care ethics has been interpreted from divergent perspectives, past and present.

A research paper must be based on secondary sources from the library or, more rarely due to time constraints for this course, on primary sources such as archival sources or newspapers. A research paper for this course will not be allowed to include Wikipedia as a source or other similar web based encyclopedia or reference sources when more scholarly and reliable material is available. For example, it is not acceptable under any circumstances to use Wikipedia as a source for Nazi medical atrocities as there are numerous scholarly, peer reviewed secondary sources that are far more reliable and in-depth than Wikipedia. If you are unsure about whether or not a source is appropriate for use in your paper, please consult the course instructor.

For graduate students, your research essay should include a minimum of approximately 20-25 secondary sources. For undergraduate students, your research essay should include a minimum of 15-20 secondary sources. There is no limit on the maximum number of sources.

Required course readings:

- 1) Purchase Reader directly from the publisher: Canadian Scholar's Press: Available online using this [link](#)
- 2) Online Journal readings (indicated in course outline) available on the York University Library database

Course instructor contact information:

Geoffrey Reaume, Ph.D., Associate Professor
Critical Disability Studies, Faculty of Graduate Studies
School of Health Policy and Management, Faculty of Health, York University
Office: Health, Nursing and Environmental Studies Building, Room 416
Phone 416-736-2100, extension 22058 Email: greaume@yorku.ca
Office Hours: Wednesdays: 10-11:30 AM, 2:30-4 PM or by appointment.

CLASS OUTLINE AND READING LIST:

Class 1 (September 16) – Introduction: Hippocrates

1) Paul Carrick, "The Hippocratic Oath", *Medical Ethics in the Ancient World* (Washington: Georgetown University Press, 2001): p. 83-112. Reader

Class 2 (September 23) – The Ancient World: Gender and Disability

2) Helen King, "Women's Health and Recovery in the Hippocratic Corpus" in H. King, ed., *Health in Antiquity* (London: Routledge, 2005): 150-161. Reader

3) Nicholas Vlahogiannis, "'Curing' Disability" in H. King, ed., *Health in Antiquity* (London: Routledge, 2005): 180-191. Reader

4) Darrel W. Amundsen, "Medicine and the Birth of Defective [sic] Children: Approaches of the Ancient World" in Amundsen, *Medicine, Society, and Faith in the Ancient and Medieval Worlds* (Kluwer Academic, 1998): 50-69. Reader

5) Martha L. Rose, "Killing Defective [sic] Babies," in Rose, *The Staff of Oedipus: Transforming Disability in Ancient Greece* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press, 2003): 29-49. Reader

Class 3 (September 30)

Charity, Religion and Gender in Medieval European and West Asian Health Care Ethics

6) Albert R. Jonsen, "Medieval Medicine: Fifth to Fourteenth Centuries CE" in Jonsen, *A Short History of Medical Ethics*. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000): 13-26. Reader

7) Roy Porter, "Medicine and Faith" in Porter, *The Greatest Benefit to Mankind: A Medical History of Humanity* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1998): 83-105. Reader

8) Martin Levey, *Medical Ethics of Medieval Islam, with Special Reference to Al-Ruhawi's "Practical Ethics of the Physician"* in *Transactions of the American Philosophical Society* 57:3 (1967): 5-17. Reader

9) April Harper, "The Image of the Female Healer in Western Vernacular Literature of the Middle Ages", *Social History of Medicine* 24:1 (April 2011): 108-124. Download from York University Library.

Class 4 (October 7) – The Impact of Plagues on Medieval and Early Modern Health Practices

10) Lawrence I. Conrad, "Epidemic Disease in Formal and Popular Thought in Early Islamic Society" in T. Ranger and P. Slack, eds., *Epidemics and Ideas: Essays on the*

Historical Perception of Pestilence (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992): 77-99. Reader

11) Paul Slack, "Responses to Plague in Early Modern Europe: The Implications of Public Health" in A. Mack, ed., *In Time of Plague: The History and Social Consequences of Lethal Epidemic Disease* (New York: New York University Press, 1991): 111-131. Reader

12) Ole Peter Grell, "Conflicting Duties: Plague and The Obligations of Early Modern Physicians Towards Patients and Commonwealth in England and The Netherlands" in A Wear, et. al., eds., *Doctors and Ethics: The Earlier Historical Setting of Professional Ethics* (Amsterdam: Rodolpi, 1993): 131-152. Reader

13) Jane Stevens Crawshaw, "The Beasts of Burial: *Pizzigamorti* and Public Health for the Plague in Early Modern Venice", *Social History of Medicine* 24:3 (December 2011): 570-587. Download from York University Library.

Class 5 (October 14)

Judeo-Christian Influences on Health Care Ethics in Medieval and Renaissance Europe

14) Darrel W. Amundsen, "Caring and Curing in the Medieval Catholic Tradition" in Amundsen, *Medicine, Society, and Faith in the Ancient and Medieval Worlds* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996): 175-221. Reader

15) Winfried Schleiner, "The Contribution of Exiled Portuguese Jews in Renaissance Medical Ethics", in Schleiner, *Medical Ethics in the Renaissance* (Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press, 1995): 49-93. Reader

Class 6 (October 21)

Respecting the Dead? The Anatomical Use of the Remains of Deceased People, 16th to 19th Centuries

16) Dawne McCance, "Anatomy as Speech Act: Vesalius, Descartes, Rembrandt or the Question of 'the animal' in the Early Modern Anatomy Lesson" in Jodey Castricano, ed., *Animal Subjects: An Ethical Reader in a Posthuman World* (Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2008): 63-95. Reader

17) Ruth Richardson, "The Corpse as a Commodity" in Richardson, *Death, Dissection and The Destitute* (London: Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1987): 52-72. Reader

18) Helen MacDonald, "Procuring Corpses: The English Anatomy Inspectorate, 1842-1858", *Medical History* 53:3 (July 2009): 379-396. Download from York University Library.

Class 7 (October 28) – Respecting the Living?

Debates on Human Medical Experimentation, 18th Century to Early 20th Century

19) Londa Schiebinger, “Medical Experimentation and Race in the Eighteenth-century Atlantic World”, *Social History of Medicine* 26:3 (August 2013): 364-382. Download from York University Library.

20) Alex Dracobly, “Ethics and Experimentation on Human Subjects in Mid-Nineteenth-Century France: The Story of the 1859 Syphilis Experiments”, *Bulletin of the History of Medicine*, 77 (2003): 332-366. Download from York University Library.

21) Barbara Elkeles, “The German Debate on Human Experimentation Between 1880 and 1914”, in V. Roelcke, G. Maio, eds., *Twentieth Century Ethics of Human Subject Research: Historical Perspectives on Values, Practices, and Regulations* (Stuttgart: Franz Steiner Verlag, 2004): 19-33. Reader

22) Ian Miller, “Necessary Torture? Vivisection, Suffragette Force-Feeding, and Responses to Scientific Medicine in Britain, c. 1870-1920”, *Journal of the History of Medicine and Allied Sciences* 64:3 (July 2009): 333-372. Download from York University Library.

Class 8 (November 4) – Medical Atrocities under the Nazis

23) Mark P. Mostert, “Useless Eaters: Disability as Genocidal Marker in Nazi Germany”, *The Journal of Special Education* 36:3 (Fall 2002): 155-168. Download from York University Library.

24) Björn M. Felder. “‘Euthanasia,’ Human Experiments, and Psychiatry in Nazi-Occupied Lithuania, 1941-1944,” *Holocaust and Genocide Studies* 27:2 (Fall 2013): 242-275. Download on-line from York University Library.

25) William E. Seidelman, “The Legacy of Academic Medicine and Human Exploitation in The Third Reich”, *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 43:3 (Spring 2000): 325-334. Download from York University Library

26) Robert N. Proctor, “Nazi Science and Nazi Medical Ethics: Some Myths and Misconceptions”, *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 43:3 (Spring 2000): 335-346. Download from York University Library

27) Michael Marrus, “The Nuremberg Doctors’ Trial in Historical Context”, *Bulletin of the History of Medicine*, 73:1 (Spring 1999): 106-123. Download from York University Library web site. Download from York University Library

28) Daniela C. Angetter, et. al., "Anatomical Science at University of Vienna, 1938-45", *The Lancet* 355 (April 22, 2000): 1454-57. Download from York University Library

29) Wolfgang Schutz, "The Medical Faculty of the University of Vienna 60 Years Following Austria's Annexation", *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 43:3 (Spring 2000): 389-396. Download from York University Library

Class 9 (November 11) – The Historical Legacy of the Nuremberg Code

30) "The Nuremberg Code (1947)". Download text of Code from this [link](#)

31) James F. Childress, "Nuremberg's Legacy: Some Ethical Reflections", *Perspectives in Biology and Medicine* 43:3 (Spring 2000): 347-361. Download from York University Library

32) Paul Weindling, "The Origins of Informed Consent: The International Scientific Commission on Medical War Crimes, and the Nuremberg Code", *Bulletin of the History of Medicine*, 75:1 (2001): 37-71. Download from York University Library.

33) Jenny Hazelgrove, "Old Faith and the New Science: The Nuremberg Code and Human Experimentation Ethics in Britain, 1946-73" *Social History of Medicine* 15:1 (2002): 109-135. Download from York University Library.

34) Nancy D. Campbell and Laura Stark, "Making up 'Vulnerable' People: Human Subjects and the Subjective Experience of Medical Experiment", *Social History of Medicine* (May 26, 2015 advance copy), 1-24 Download using this [link](#)

Class 10 (November 18)

Medical Experiments on Marginalized People in North American and Central American History

35) Harriet A. Washington, *Medical Apartheid: The Dark History of Medical Experimentation on Black Americans from Colonial Times to the Present* (New York: Doubleday, 2006), p. 52-74 (Chapter 2); 157-185 (Chapter 7). Reader.

36) Allen Hornblum and Edward Anthony, *Sentenced to Science: One Black Man's Story of Imprisonment in America* (University Park, PA: The Pennsylvania State University Press, 2007): 41-54. Reader

37) Advisory Committee on Human Radiation Experiments, "The Fernald School Experiments Were Morally Wrong", in Kelly Barth, ed., *Human Medical Trials* (Detroit: Thomson-Gale, 2005): 103-111. Reader

38) Kayte Spector-Bagdady and Paul A. Lombardo, “‘Something of an Adventure’: Postwar NIH Research Ethos and the Guatemala STD Experiments,” *Journal of Law, Medicine & Ethics* 41:3 (Fall 2013), 697-710. Download from York University Library.

39) Ian Mosby, “Administering Colonial Science: Nutrition Research and Human Biomedical Experimentation in Aboriginal Communities and Residential Schools, 1942-1952”, *Histoire sociale/Social History* 46:91 (May 2013), 145-172. Download from York University Library

Class 11 (November 25) – Medical Codes of Ethics since the 19th Century: Principles and Practice

40) Robert M. Veatch, *Disrupted Dialogue: Medical Ethics and the Collapse of Physician-Humanist Communication (1770-1980)* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005): 145-154. Reader

41) Susan E. Lederer, “Rules for Research: Human Experimentation and the AMA Code of Ethics”, in Lederer, *Subjected to Science: Human Experimentation in America before the Second World War* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University, 1997): 73-100. Reader

42) “CMA Code of Ethics (Update 2004)” *Canadian Medical Association*. Ottawa, Ontario, 2004: 4 pages. Reader

43) David Adams, “Artificial Kidneys and the Emergence of Bioethics: The History of ‘Outsiders’ in the Allocation of Haemodialysis”, *Social History of Medicine* 24:2 (August 2011), 461-477. Download from York University Library.

44) Leith Passmore, “The Ethics and Politics of Force-Feeding Terror Suspects in West German Prisons”, *Social History of Medicine* 25:2 (May 2012): 481-489. Download from York University Library.

45) Sonia Shah, *The Body Hunters: Testing New Drugs on the World’s Poorest Patients* (New York: The New Press, 2006): 1-17. Reader

Class 12 (December 2) – Immigration, Class and Racial Conceptions of ‘Healthy’ Citizens

46) Alan M. Kraut, “A Plague of Nativism: The Cases of Chick Gin and ‘Typhoid Mary’”, Chapter 4 in A. Kraut, *Silent Travelers: Germs, Genes and the ‘Immigrant Menace’* (New York: Basic Books, 1994): 78-104. Reader

47) Kirsten Burnett, "Race, Disease, and Public Violence: Smallpox and the (Un)Making of Calgary's Chinatown," *Social History of Medicine* 25:2 (May 2012): 362-379. Download from York University Library.

48) Roxanna Galusca, "From Fictive Ability to National Identity: Disability, Medical Inspection, and Public Health Regulations on Ellis Island", *Cultural Critique* 72 (Spring 2009): 137-163. Download from York University Library.